Female Gender As Non-Attachment And Field-Of-Merit: Venerable Dhammananda Ordination As Bhikkhuni In The Thai Theravada Buddhist Context

Suat Yan Lai

**Claremont Graduate University** 

University of Malaya, Malaysia

Draft: please do not quote

Introduction

Thailand is a Theravada Buddhist country. Historically, Buddhism has flourished by

adapting to the local practices and customs as exemplified in the context of Thailand. The

beliefs and practices of Buddhism co-exist with not only indigenous animism but also

Brahmanism. Scholars researching gender construction and relations in Thai society have

looked at a range of Buddhist literature including the popular Buddhist text Trai Phum

Phra Ruang (subsequently shortened as Trai Phum) and Vessantara Jataka that either

forms the basis of sermons in the monastic context or for villagers and is part of the

curricula in the university or school context<sup>1</sup> to delineate the gender imagery presented.

From this, they conclude either that Buddhism is oppressive or liberating for women. The

Buddhist Canon has also been evaluated for similar purposes. The argument that

Buddhism is liberating for women generally attributes the negative images of women to

the influence of Brahmanism that took root during the Ayudhaya period. Scholars who

differ with this position argue that it is impossible to separate the philosophy of

Buddhism from the influence of local culture and deem Buddhism as responsible for the

negative images of women and their subordinate position relative to men.

1

What are the implications of these various textual imageries and interpretations on the lives of Thai Buddhist? Is text a mirror-reflection of society or is text understood and used variedly by different strata and backgrounds of Thai Buddhist society? Discussion of these questions are followed by an analysis of collaborative efforts of transnational Buddhist women and organizations to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination in tradition or country where it is not in existent as well as provide general support for women who decide to lead the homeless life. Specifically, there will be an emphasis on the significance and implications of Venerable Dhammanada's construction of the female gender as monks which revisions femaleness as non-attachment, sources of merit and conveyor of blessings and protection. Related question that are addressed included whether women's adoption of the monastic robes means a privileging of the masculine soteriological model that affirms the mind over the body. Or does it offer a model of feminine spirituality? Or is there a co-existence of various models including one that is non-gendered as evident in the training of mindfulness that is based on the interconnection of the mind and the body?

Images of women in Buddhist Literature

#### a)) The Mother

Kornvipa Boonsue's analysis of the *Trai Phum* commissioned by King Rama I in the late eighteenth century found that one of the images of women in Thai Buddhist literature is as mother.<sup>ii</sup> As a mother and great devotee in a story, she was rewarded with 500 sons for her good *karma* in providing alms to 500 monks. Attached to this image of mother in Buddhist literature is nurturer whether to her children, husband or as devotee of the religion as pointed by Thomas

Kirsch and Charles Keyes.<sup>iii</sup> In the context of rural northern and northeastern Thailand, the dominant image of woman in the Buddhist text "Blessings Of Ordination" is in fact, as mother. In this text, ordination for man is emphasized to enable a better rebirth for his parents, namely in heaven. Since ordination is not possible for woman, the status of the son is emphasized in the family. Significantly, men, as father and son are not attached to the family unit as the mother is. iii

According to Kornvipa Boonsue, the story of a mother's good conduct rewarded with 500 sons and not even a daughter affirms the superiority of the male sex. In the hierarchical structure of this Buddhist cosmological text, females are located at the bottom with non-sex beings at the top followed by males. Suwadee Patana studying the 1802 version of this text came to similar conclusions as "one was born a woman and not a man because of an inadequate store of Buddhist merit'. Significantly, the *bodhisattva* is never conceived in a female form only the male. In contrast, the reward for a man with good conduct as represented by the king in this story is many wives. The bigger number of wives the king has, the more glorious, powerful, fertile and prosperous his kingdom is. Xi

## b) The ideal wife

In the *Trai Phum* the image of an ideal wife is a woman who is subordinate to her husband. Signified by Queen Nangkaeo, whose husband is the Universal Monarch, she complements him, waits on him, satisfies him, and is obedient as well as faithful to him. As *nangkaeo* meaning

gem woman or ideal woman, she is from a high status family such as royalty. She has made merit in her previous lives and is endowed with beauty.

The subordinate relation of wife to husband is also reflected in the Vessantara Jataka, xiv the most popular Jataka for the Thais. In the last life, before the historical Gautama Buddha becomes a Buddha as Prince Vessantara, his virtuous giving reaches its zenith; he gives away not only riches but also his flesh and blood. As Prince Vessantara's ideal wife, Madsi considers all her husband wishes as hers and accepts with faith when her husband gives away their two children and later herself.xv Suwanna Satha-Anand commented that Madsi is not recognized as a bodhisattva like her husband, Vessantara, because in the context of the relationship, she and the children belong to him and thus theoretically they are not hers to give away.xvi

### c) Other images of women

In addition to the image of woman as mother and the ideal wife in *Trai Phum*, Kornvipa Boonsue delineated two other images that of the ideal woman and prostitute. The ideal woman dwells in the Sri Arya Maitreya society, a Buddhist utopia where it is classless, stateless, and there is neither private property nor exploitation. She has accumulated great merit in her past lives and is endowed with eternal beauty. She still procreates but caring for the child is socialized with children not even knowing their birth parents. On the other hand, a woman is born as a prostitute for cursing a monk in her previous life. Like the ideal woman, wife, and mother, she cannot runs away from procreation. \*\*xviii\*

While women are endowed with beauty for their past virtue, it needs to be mentioned that beauty can be a source of craving for both women and men. In the *Trai Phum*, Queen Phusati ten wishes are mainly centered on physical beauty other than her wish for a son. In Buddhist literature, including the Buddhist Canon, beautiful women are portrayed as temptress who seduces and leads men away from the homeless life as the Buddha was prior to his enlightenment. In the Jataka tales or previous live stories of the Buddha, women were portrayed not only as jealous, narrow-minded and ignorant but also as lower beings bounded by the material, illusory world and could cause man to be tied to desire and anger.

Influence of Indian Culture on Buddhist Attitudes Towards Women, including Pollution Taboos

According to scholars, the images of women reflected in Buddhist literature are influenced by
Indian culture, the birth-place of Buddhism. Historically, Thailand has also been under the
influence of Brahmanism particularly during the Ayudhaya period (1350-1767) when it
flourished. The legal code developed at this time, Manu Dharmasastra, and the concept of GodKing to consolidate the power of the King is derived from the Hindu context.\*\*

The ideal characteristics of the wife embodied in Queen Nangkaeo and Madsi as obedient, virtuous,
faithful, self—sacrificing and subordinate is reminiscent of Sita the heroine of the Indian epic
Ramayana.\*\*

Ramayana.\*\*

In terms of ownership of woman by her husband, it is rooted in Manu where as
daughter woman is subject to the authority of the father, as wife to the husband and as widow to
the son. The idea of woman of lower birth vis-à-vis man is traceable to Brahmanism.\*\*

Not

only that the image of woman as seducer or temptress that led astray even the learned found expression in Manu, the law-giver of ancient India. xxiv

Similarly, a belief in menstruation as polluting and negating sacred power is attributed to Brahmanism. During the Ayudhaya period, Brahamnism was instrumental in the production of magical charm for the protection of soldiers who would become disempowered if in contact with menstruating women or their menstrual blood.\*\* This belief renders women as 'unclean' or defiled. Thus, they are devalued symbolically and relegated to the bottom of the moral and religious order.\*\*

# Eight Garudhamma, Female Ordination and Female Subordination

According to the Buddhist Canon, while the Buddha affirms women's spirituality, he was reluctant to establish the female order and did so only upon the acceptance of the Eight *Garudhamma* (Special Rules). This Eight *Garudhamma* and his prediction that female ordination shortened the life span of the religion by half, xxviii has led some scholars to point to the element of discrimination or gender bias in the Buddhist Canon itself. As an example, the first rule of the Eight *Garudhamma* states that even a *bhikkhuni* who has been ordained one hundred years must pay respect to a *bhikkhu* ordained for a day. This reverses the usual hierarchy of seniority based on the length of one's monastic ordination. Effectively, this rule subordinates the female monastic order to the male order.

Furthermore, rule six of the *Garudhamma* stipulates a required two-year probation period before a dual ordination can be conducted by both the *bhikkhuni* and the *bhikkhu* Sangha. In contrast, male monastic does not have to go through this probation period and the ordination ceremony is only by the *bhikkhu* Sangha. Male monastic also observe less precepts, 227 compared to female monastic who observe 311, since "they were considered to be weak, sensual and easily tempted, or would inspire lust in the male monks and cause their downfall."

For the ecclesiastical authority in Thailand, the requirement for dual ordination means that it is now technically impossible to ordain women as the Theravada Buddhist lineage of *bhikkhuni* has disappeared by 11<sup>th</sup> century in Sri Lanka.<sup>xxxi</sup> Quoting the highly respected Thai monk and an authority of the Buddhist canonical texts, Phra Dhammapitaka (P. Payutto):

"The matter is clear and simple. Women today have as much right to be ordained as women of the Buddha's time. The predicament, however, lies in the fact that nobody is present now who has the right to give them ordination."

Instead, Phra Dhammapitaka favors improving the status of the institution of *mae chi* as there is continuity in tradition. Efforts have been directed toward this end, for example, by Khunying Kanitha, a well-known social activist and an influential lawyer who fought for women's rights before ordaining as a *mae chi* at age seventy-three. She is credited with establishing the Mahapajapati Theri Buddhist college in 1999 that caters to *mae chi* as well as women in general. Unfortunately, her efforts in campaigning for the proposed nuns' law to accord *mae chi* legal recognition as ordained persons was rejected by the authorities in 2003. \*\*XXXIIII\* While there are concurrent efforts to improve the status of *mae chi* and to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination in

Thailand, the Eight *Garudhamma* effectively subordinates the female monastic order to their male counterpart and has been attributed by Chatsumarn Kabilsingh to the bias of the recorder of the Buddhist Canon that are influenced by the Indian social cultural milieu. xxxiv

### Textual Buddhist Attitudes Toward Women and Its Relations to Social Practices

Utilizing the Gramscian notion of hegemonic ideology, Kornvipa Boonsue analyzed gender imageries contained in the popular *Trai Phum* and *Jataka* tales as well as identified elements of gender discrimination in the Buddhist canon. According to her, failure to confront the root causes of gender bias articulated in these religious texts will only preserve the role of "Buddhism as an effective producer and reproducer of gender bias." She provided instances of discriminatory social practices based on such gender beliefs to argue for the importance of addressing ideological transformation in the National Development Plan of Thailand to enable meaningful social change.

One of the examples she gave to demonstrate the hegemonic ideology contained in Buddhist texts was the social valuation of women as mothers in Thai culture. Given the important place of procreation for women and female inferiority vis-à-vis male superiority, women unable to provide an offspring are mistreated by the family or husbands while those who only give birth to girls are equated with those who cannot provide any offspring. According to her, this Thai traditional thought ignores the scientific one which attributes the sex of the fetus to both parents. In brief, she argued for the relevance of Buddhist texts to understand social practices.

The unequal gender relations between women and men depicted in *Trai Phum* and Vessantara Jataka is reflected in the Thai saying of women being the hind legs of the elephant and emphasized, for example, during the "Nation Building" Policy period from 1938-1944 under the rule of the Prime Minister P. Pibul Songkram. According to Suwadee T. Patana this policy stressed gender differences with men as "fences of the nation" and women the "flowers of the nation". As she pointed out, men's duties were as protector of the nation's sovereignty. Women were as beautiful and submissive wives or daughters who centered their lives in household work and on their beauty to bring happiness to their husbands and fathers for whom they provided moral support. Women's role as mothers was emphasized with the establishment of Mother's Day to support the goal of having a large population. Considered weaker physically than men, a government official recruitment regulation barred women from many official positions.

Individual as well as the women's movement have played crucial roles leading to the gradual amendment of various laws to ensure equality between women and men in the civil service as well as in family life. Regulations barring women from certain positions such as being the village chief and district administrator thereby blocking their advancement or opportunities to higher administrative or political posts and functions were respectively abolished in 1982 and 1993. Nonetheless, traditional values steeped in sexual double standard persist in the family law as legally only husbands can use adultery as grounds to initiate divorce against his wife and not the other way round. Similarly, the unequal engagement rights treat women's sexuality as belonging to her fiancé. In terms of sexual practices, men's virility and promiscuity are tolerated if not accepted while women who behave in similar ways are labeled as sluts.

Women are also unequal citizens compared to men in the eyes of the law as those who marry foreigners face a much more complicated process in transmitting their nationality to their husbands.xliii

In her anthropological study among laywomen (including a former *mae chi*), Penny Van Esterik concluded that *mae chi*, who followed the religious lifestyle and observe eight to ten precepts, are devalued. This is because of their anomalous position of not being allowed to ordain, yet fail to fulfill gender roles prescribed by society as giver of life through their reproductive capacity and sustaining their family through their earning power. In contrast, laywomen like Na Chat and Phi Daeng are admired in their role as householders who ensured the continued survival and flourishing of the monastic order. In Furthermore, women are seen to mature through marriage with the birth of a child and the postpartum ritual of "lying by the fire" or *yu fai* confirming her adulthood status.

Reflecting the values embedded in Buddhist texts, ordination for men is a wholesome and most virtuous act. Ordination will generate great merit not only for the son, but also the mother who has nurtured him and willingly allowed him to go forth to join the monastic order. The greater the store of merit, the better chances for a better rebirth in the next life, a goal of the majority of lay Thai Buddhists. As Van Esterik study above demonstrates, Na Chat believes that she will not be reborn lower than the human realm such as in hell with the ordination of her sons. Alvii Parallel to the valuation of ordination for men, it is a rite of passage for them to be conferred adulthood status in rural central Thailand. Alviii It is common practice for Thai Buddhist men to be

ordained once in their lives during the rainy season retreat. Those who have ordained also increase their appeal as potential husbands. Furthermore, Thomas Kirsh noted that the positive Buddhist sanction for religious and political-bureaucratic roles contributed to the sexual division of labor with men specializing in these roles while women in economic-entrepreneurial ones.

A layperson, once referred to as *khon*, moves to the higher moral sphere of *ong* upon ordination. In the hierarchy of merit, monks occupy higher positions than kings. Yoneo Ishii observed that the monastic order asserts moral superiority in its observance of precepts with the king acceding to the Buddha's domain in his reverence and piety to the extent that some have ordained as monks. Monks observe 227 precepts and is *bunyaket* or constitutes a field of merit in relation to laypersons who will strive to increase their store of merit by providing for his material needs through offering of almsfood, necessities, or monetary donations besides the observance of five or eight precepts. Those ordained typically receive training to be ritual specialists and access to monastic education.

While monks from disadvantaged background can be sources of merit and advances himself socially, liv such option is not open for *mae chi* from similar background who are generally looked down upon and ended up as cooks and cleaners for the monastery. Nevertheless, there are *mae chi* who have established themselves, are well-respected and supported by their followers particularly at independent nunnery. Monica Lindberg Falk pointed out that at the Ratburi nunnery, the public presence of *mae chi* in the performance of rituals combined with their hard

work and monastic discipline have gained them informal legitimacy as religious specialists and consequently acceptance and support from the laity. Ivi

Even if there is correspondence between the values embedded in Buddhist texts with certain social practices, including the Buddhist ecclesiastical authority move that disbars women from ordination, it is not accepted by all Thais. There have been efforts to revive *bhikkhuni* ordination in Thailand since the 1920s. Prior to her ordination as *bhikkhuni* a decade earlier, Chatsumarn Kabilsingh went as far as to suggest in a seminar in 1989 that *mae chi* are to be considered as fields of merit worthy of the offerings of the laity. As a Buddhist scholar, she cited work that questioned the authenticity of the Eight *Garudhamma* as the words of the Buddha and attributed it to the social biases of the monks who recorded the texts. Unequivocally, she sees Buddhism as liberating for women in its proclamation that women can be spiritually enlightened as well. She advocates for the return to the 'pure' message of the Buddha, reinterprets the female imagery in the Buddhist literature and offers a reading of the Canon that supports female ordination. The belief of menstruation as polluting and its related social practices such as non-allowance of women to circumambulate the *stupa* containing sacred relics, she attributed to Brahmanism. She also attributed the negative images of women to traditional Chinese influences.

The significance of Kabilisingh's critique of the authenticity of Buddhist text are two-fold. Firstly, texts reflect the social background of its authors and is not necessarily what the Buddha intended and secondly, the gender discourses in Buddhist texts are not being blindly accepted by all its followers who bring their own perspective, subjectivity as well scholarly training in

interpreting Buddhist texts. While Kornvipa Boonsue is critical of the possibility of separating the liberating philosophy of Buddhism from other cultural influences and institutional structures that is bias toward women, she and Kabilsingh concur in the possibility of change and by extension, the fluidness of what it means to be female in Thai Buddhist society.

In this regard, the Canadian anthropologist, Penny Van Esterik noted not only the importance of Theravada Buddhism as the lens from which Thai understands their lives, but as a living tradition its "morals and metaphors are constantly changing." She observed not only the usefulness of Buddhist ideology, as transmitted from sermons (and inspired by texts) to understand social practices, but noted the disjunctures or paradoxes as well. The lives of *mae chi*, both young and old defied the Buddhist assumption of women as being more rooted in the world and attached to the family. Rather than opting for marriage and children or to continue being within the familial set-up, they chose the ascetic lives even if their community criticized this decision.

Thomas Kirsch added to the discussion by emphasizing the importance of context in understanding texts. In particular, he dealt directly with the relationship between texts and social practices where the encounter between texts and its readers are influenced by their respective interests and perspectives. In this regard, texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers, a point Kirsh shared with Charles Keyes However, Kirsch noted too that while the cultural construction of people's lives may be influenced by texts, "they are not reducible to them (texts)". In this regard, texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers, a point Kirsh shared with Charles Keyes However, Kirsch noted too that while the cultural construction of people's lives may be influenced by texts, "they are not reducible to them (texts)". In this regard, texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers, a point Kirsh shared with Charles Keyes how the influenced by texts, they are not reducible to them (texts)". In this regard, texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers, a point Kirsh shared with Charles Keyes In the influenced by texts for the study of texts for "a coherent view of some domain of experience in the world", In this regard, texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers, a point Kirsh shared with Charles Keyes In the influenced by texts are not only accepted but negotiated, critiqued and reinterpreted by its readers.

of people's lives as 'texts' in the search for cultural coherence or lack of it. Nevertheless, Buddhist texts provide the legitimacy and are an important resource for feminist Buddhists like Venerable Dhammananda in her search for an usable past that valorizes women, recognizes their abilities and contributions whether material or spiritual.

Notwithstanding, Kirsch's observation above, his debate with Keyes, is critiqued by Nicola Tannenbaum for being conducted in "textual, normative Buddhist terms". She criticizes the use of texts as sources of 'real' religion as due to Western orientalist perspectives or in Gregory Schopen's term Protestant's pre-suppositions. However, the importance of texts as the repository of the original 'truth' has a long history in Thailand well before the reign of King Mongkut, (Rama IV) who came into contact with western powers. King Rama I (1782-1809) ordered and completed the ninth revision of the *Tripitak*a to "restore 'the original texts' of the canon. Charles Hallisey described such coincidence in religious development or the study of religion as an "elective affinity' between the positive historiography of European Orientalism and some Buddhist styles of self-representation". In Italian with the study of the canon buddhist styles of self-representation".

Tannenbaum also critiqued the over-use of the Buddhist framework to make sense of Thai society. Ixxiv Her observation finds partial support in Van Esterik's caution between "reducing Buddhism to a determinant ... and ignoring its ideological force." At other times, Van Esterik's statement is overly sweeping as when she mentioned that "(t)o be Thai is to be Buddhist", Ixxvi a pronouncement that most southern Thai-Muslims will resent given the continued existence of efforts to secede from Thailand and the ongoing violence including the

murder of monks there. However, she is right on the mark in her observation of the diversity of Buddhist practice that varies by class, region as well as ethnicity.

Class as well as gender marks this study on Venerable Dhammananda's (formerly Chatsumarn Kabilsingh) efforts to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination in the Thai Theravada lineage. She is from a well-to-do background, highly educated and learned in the Buddhist Canon as a former professor in Philosophy and Religion at Thammasat University. It was her mother, also an advocate for *bhikkhuni* ordination and a *bhikkhuni* herself who garnered the resources to build the monastery where Venerable Dhammananda resides and have continued to maintain and rebuild as part of her role as the abbess of the monastery. Her efforts for ordination and construction of gender that revalorizes femaleness as field-of-merit and signifying non-attachment as well as release from this world will be contextualized locally amidst Buddhist reforms for change and the global efforts for female ordination in the next section.

Bhikkhuni Ordination in Thailand and Transnational Collaborative Efforts

"And be it woman, be it man for whom such chariot doth wait, by the same car into Nirvana presence shall they come. [xxviii]

Upholding the spiritual equality for women to gain enlightenment expressed in the Buddhist Canon, three waves of pioneering bhikkhuni have continued the efforts of establishing the bhikkhuni lineage. The first involved the efforts of two sisters Sara Phasit and Chongdi, with their father, Narin Phasit, as their staunch advocate from the late 1920s to early 1930s. Sara Bhaist appealed to the Buddha's legacy of establishing bhikkhuni ordination for their initiative and sees it as completing the four groups of Buddhists existing during Buddha's time, namely bhikkhu, bhikkhuni, laymen and laywomen. Notably, her father Narin Phasit, partially evoked the Buddha's teaching in the Kalama Sutta, to be critical and not blindly believe anything based on whether it is in the scriptural text or not as the reason to support reestablishing bhikkhuni ordination. Both sisters were only ordained by monks. In response, the ecclesiastical authority declared it invalid as well as established a rule in 1928 forbidding monks from ordaining women from the novice to the highest level as repsectively samaneri, sikhamana and bhikkhuni. Ikxxxi

The second wave of *bhikkhuni* ordination was initiated by Voramai Kabilsingh, the contemporary of Sara and Chongdhi but at a much later time after marrying and having a family in 1956. Considered unconventional, she was also the first Thai woman to train in jujitsu, boxing, sword-fighting and to journey twenty-eight days on a bicycle to Singapore with a group of Boy Scouts. Establishing the first monastery for women in Thailand, she named it *Watra Songdharma Kalyani* or a place where women perform *dharma* practice. She was known for her healing abilities and social work of establishing an orphanage. After her passing away recently, her effort is succeeded by her daughter with the ordained name of Dhammananda. While continuing the healing tradition established during her mother's time, Venerable Dhammananda

differs in focusing her efforts to build a female Sangha to ensure *bhikkhuni* ordination in Thailand survives into the future.

The possibility for *bhikkhuni* ordination in Venerable Dhammananda's case as in the earlier waves is rooted in their belief on what they considered as the Buddha's legacy or tradition, a point emphasized in both sides efforts to support or invalid the ordination. In other words, the strategy for *bhikkhuni* ordination appropriates an exemplary past to legitimize the present. Furthermore, the claim to authenticity or what Buddha's authentic words or intentions is in effect to stake the right to speak on a subject matter as well as to delegitimize those considered inauthentic from speaking. While as a feminist Buddhist Venerable Dhammananda is clearly blazing the path for women to become a *bhikkhuni* in Thailand, however, she does not stress on rights and equality. Rather she utilizes the Buddhist terminology of duty and responsibility to carry out the Buddha's legacy.

Nonetheless, similar to other efforts in Asian countries to further the interests and status of women *bhikkhuni* ordination has been criticized and characterized as a demand for rights and "immersed in rights-oriented western mind-set". The statement by Nithi Easiwong, well-respected historian, demonstrates the obstacle faced by women who wanted to live the ordained life:

"This is not about rights. It is about justice. Why, when a woman wants to be ordained, does it mean she is demanding more rights, but when a man wants to be ordained, he is seen as doing his duty?" | |

Interestingly, Sulak Sivaraksa, who has been most critical of the negative effects of the western influenced economic models in Thailand that encourages consumerism and materialism is supportive of establishing female ordination. He even suggested broadening the interpretation of the third precept on sexual misconduct in line with current needs. According to him:

"This [third] precept is not only about sexual assault or committing adultery. It also involved sexual exploitation and gender discrimination. Sometimes it is subtle, like allowing women to be used for advertising or paying them less for identical work as men." |xxxvi

Confounding the difficulty of establishing *bhikkhuni* ordination in Thailand is the centralized feature of the Thai ecclesiastical authority based in Bangkok, established under the Sangha Act of 1902. Effectively, this means that the Sangha falls under the jurisdiction of the secular power of the state, which is also reflected in the Sangha Act of 1941 and 1963. The standardization of observances mandated by the central ecclesiastical authority has resulted in among others the marginalization of regional Buddhist practices [xxxviii] and the non-recognition of bhikkhuni ordination. At the legislative levels, supporters of bhikkhuni ordination such as the feminist Thai senator, Rabiebrat Pongpanich have lobbied for the cause but to date have not succeeded.

However, the prospect of establishing *bhikkhuni* ordination in Thailand is heightened by global networking and movement to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination as exemplified by the work of Sakyaditha (Daughters of the Buddha), a transnational network of Buddhist women, of whom Venerable Dhammananda was a former president from 1991-1995. As pointed out by

Venerable Dhammananda, the absence of the centralization of power vested in the ecclesiastical authority in Sri Lanka is one of the factors that enable the revival of *bhikkhuni* ordination there in the 1990s. Senior Sri Lankan monks who favor the revival of female ordination has been instrumental in supporting the international dual ordination conducted over the last two decades with the assistance of Mahayana *bhikkhuni* from, for example, Taiwan and Korea. Nonetheless,

holding the Sakyaditha conference there in 1993 have provided the impetus for the revival of the female monastic order as shared by its first *bhikkhuni*, Bhikkhuni Kusuma. Bhikkhuni Kusama was also then the president of Sakyaditha, Sri Lanka and together with Ranjani de Silva, the Secretary, approached Bhikkhu Mapalagama Vipulasara Thero, president of the Mahabodhi Society of India as well as founder and secretary of the World Buddhist Sakyamuni Sangha Council who was receptive. Their cooperation and assistance of the Korean Sangha consequentially saw the ordination of the Sri Lanka bhikkhunis on December 8, 1996 at the very spot where the Buddha preached his first sermon in Sarnath, India.

The Dambulla chapter in Sri Lanka and the Sri Lanka Sakyaditha chapter now conduct *bhikkhuni* ordination on their own since they have managed to establish at least a quorum of at least five *bhikkhuni* for ordination. Venerable Dhammmananda herself received her *samaneri* and *bhikkhuni* ordination in Sri Lanka in 2001 and 2003 respectively. At the international level, there has been concerted collaborative efforts between eastern and western monastic members of the various traditions, to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination in the Vajrayana tradition as well. The decision to hold the Sakyaditha international conference in Kuala Lumpur in 2006 has also drawn attention to the issue of *bhikkhuni* ordination for women in the Theravada Buddhist

tradition. When asked his opinion on bhikkhuni ordination then, the late Venerable Dr. K. Sri Dhammananda, the Chief High Priest in Malaysia responded in the affirmative. In any event, he was too ill then to see it through and passed away around two months later. The seeds seem to have been planted then and now a well-respected *bhikkhu* in Malaysia, is exploring how best to establish the *bhikkhuni* order in Malaysia. There is also plans in the work to for a delegation of Malaysian women to attend the coming Sakyaditha conference in Vietnam in 2010. The current president of Sakyaditha, Karma Lekshe Tsomo, noted that some of the achievements of Sakyaditha are the setting up of, for example, schools and retreat centers for women in their countries by those who attended the conference, opening the dialogue on *bhikkhuni* ordination, increasing feminist awareness among Buddhist women, and a steep growth in the interest in research on Buddhist women. \*\*Cii\*\*

While there is an increasing interest in some countries for the establishment of bhikkhuni ordination as well as an increasing number of woman who wants to be ordained in Thailand, the ecclesiastical authority there does not even recognize Venerable Dhammananda's ordination. At best, she is regarded as of the Mahayana lineage since the dual ordination is only possible with the involvement of Mahayana *bhikkhuni*. Proponents of the establishment of *bhikkhuni* ordination contest this stand in three main ways. Firstly, study of the *bhikkhuni patimokkha* (monastic vows) showed that the Dharmagupta lineage observed by Mahayana *bhikkhuni* is a sub-section of the Theravada tradition. As noted by Richard Gombrich, there is nothing inherently Mahayanist about the vinaya of the Mahayanist nuns (*bhikkhuni*) of the Far East. East He also observed that no statement in the scripture prohibits Mahayana bhikkhuni from officiating at a Theravada ordination ceremony. Historically, female monastic from Sri Lanka

went to China in 429 AD to confer higher ordination to their female counterpart of the Nanking temple. xcvi

Secondly, ordination by monks alone is still possible as the Buddha has not revoked this method. The Vinaya Cullavagga it is stated by the Buddha that "I permit you, monks, to confer ordination on women". This permission was given to monks to ordain the retinue of royal women who came together with Mahapajapati for ordination. Thirdly, the Sri Lankan Venerable Dhammaloka, an expert in the Vinaya and Dhamma, pointed out that:

"The Buddha did not teach anything called Theravada. The Tipitaka mentions nothing about the Theravada. Therefore, the vociferous insistence on Theravada is meaningless." xcviii

A well-known Buddhist scholar in Thailand reiterated a similar position by drawing attention to the fact that during the Buddha's time the Mahayana and the Theravada tradition have not come into existence and what is in existence is the Buddhist bhikkhuni Sangha. This position reflects a non-sectarian approach or universal Buddhism. This approach is gradually finding its place in Thailand and reflects not only Venerable Dhammananda's approach but Buddhadasa Bhikkhu who reforms Buddhism. Buddhadasa Bhikkhu has drawn from the Mahayana tradition in adopting a rational approach to reconcenptualize Buddhism doctrinally, whereby *nibbana* and *samsara* is considered as states of mind and exists in the here and now. In a broader sense, the non-sectarian approach is evident in Buddhadasa Bhikkhu's work to cultivate inter-religious understanding. Another exemplar of the non-sectarian or ecumenical approach to religion in Thailand is the internationally well-known social critic Sulak Sivaraksa who espouses socially

engaged Buddhism. Ciii This presence of reformist Buddhism is another indication of the lack of a unified Buddhism in Thailand just as the presence of the regional forest Buddhist tradition in the earlier century is.

The ecclesiastical authority in Thailand is in fact facing a crisis of moral authority as argued by Charles Keyes. As an example, Phra Bodhirak established his own center and order outside the Sangha purview. This general crisis of moral authority indicates a weakening of the position of the Sangha and Venerable Dhammananda's efforts to establish *bhikkhuni* ordination is further example of the challenge to the ecclesiastical authority. Notably, women who joined Santi Asoke, founded by Phra Bodhirak, can lived the householder life or be ordained. The status of a *sikkhamat* is higher than *mae chi* given their responsibilities as teachers of the *Dharma* as well as being part of the community decision-makers. Nevertheless, their station is not on equal footing with their male counterpart, the *samana* who observed 227 precepts while they observed only ten precepts. Furthermore, there is an enforced ratio of 4 *samana* to 1 *sikkhamat* with the result that women underwent a much more lengthy waiting time and training to be a *sikkhamat*. The reason given is that it is harder to control women's behavior due to the difference socialization of women and men.

Similarly, Buddhadasa Bhikkhu have planned to establish a residential facility to support women's aspiration to become *dhamma-mata* or Dhamma Mothers meaning "those who give birth through *dhamma*." However, there have been differing opinions as to whether Buddhadasa Bhikkhu supports *bhikkhuni* ordination. What seems clear is Buddhadasa

Bhikkhu recognized the limitations of being *mae chi* and sought to provide equal opportunities for spiritual practice for women even if he "was not in a position to give the Dhamma Mothers the same social status as *bhikkhu*." Nevertheless, Buddhadasa Bhikkhu, I contend is being subversive in his appropriation of women as mothers who give birth and nurture the *dhamma* instead of babies. The use of the metaphor mother connotes that they are to be respected and honored as mothers are in Thai society. At the same time, Buddhadasa Bhikkhu, questions the notion of women as attached to the family and if at all they are "attached" it is to the *dharma*.

In the context of Venerable Dhammananda's efforts to reclaim the Buddha's legacy for women's ordination in Thailand, the aspiration is to both provide equal opportunities for spiritual practice and comparable social status for women who live the ordained life. She is walking the path with faith, working to build society's acceptance that will one day change the tide of opinion towards female ordination.

Gender as an analytical category: The tension between a gendered and non-gendered process of monasticism

The study focusing on Venerable Dhammananda's efforts for establishing female ordination revolves around the social construction of gender as one of the primary ways of experiencing the Buddhist religious context in Thailand. It builds on the scholarly work of Penny Van Esterik whose analysis of "a dualism linking women with fertility, nurturance and attachment, and men

with supra-mundane power and detachment finds support in Thomas Kirsch's work as well as Nicola Tannenbaum's observation of the differential access of women and men to spiritual power and privilege. Noting that gender is a social construction, the study confirms other scholars work on gender as fluid and changing as it is constantly subject to contestation and being renegotiated, the example here being Venerable Dhammananda's revisioning of the possibility of female ordination. In this process of revisioning femaleness as a symbol of non-attachment and otherworldly, gender boundaries are blurred. As gender is a protean category, what it means to be of a particular gender is constantly challenged and reified at the same time. While Venerable Dhammananda went further by reclaiming the space for women for full-ordination, this symbolism of women as non-attachment and otherworldly reinforces the challenge posed by the non-attached lives followed by *mae chiis*.

Significantly, Venerable Dhammananda efforts for women's ordination as *bhikkhuni* present the possibility for women to be "fields-of-merit" and affirm their gender identity. This can be illustrated in the role of an ordained person, who is trained and skilled as a ritual specialist, a domain previously monopolized by monks. As a ritual specialist, Venerable Dhammananda has been invited for the blessing of a new home and trees in addition to giving blessings after the morning almsround. Venerable Dhammananda is gradually establishing herself as a ritual specialist, a novel idea in Thailand where monks are the signifier of the sacred and spiritual potency. Traditionally, as highlighted by Penny Van Esterik's analysis of the roles of laywomen in Theravada Buddhism in central Thailand through Na Chat who is skilled in healing and ritual protection, the Buddhist stanzas recited to complement the use of herbs in curing illnesses "would be more powerful if spoken by a monk" than by her or other layman. on the sacred and spiritual protection, the Buddhist stanzas recited to complement the use of herbs in curing illnesses "would be more powerful if spoken by a monk" than by her or other layman.

monastic life observing 227 precepts as layout by the Buddha. Therefore, they are the most efficacious in eliciting the power emanating from the words of the Buddha. By implication, ordained women who also follow the footpath of the Buddha and observed even more precepts are also considered as efficacious in emanating beneficial force as they recite these sacred words. While some lay persons may feel that they are receiving higher merits by making offerings to bhikkhunis who observe more precepts, Venerable Dhammnanda is quick to insist that this does not mean that bhikkhunis are higher than bhikkhus. exvi

Compared to previously where women are only in the roles of making offerings, the possibility of ordination for them counters B.J.Terwiels's characterization of women during their attendance in ceremonies as "always in a passive role, only as recipients of merit and not as primary generators of beneficial karma." Now, once ordained women can also be sources of merit. As sources merit, women can also in the words of Peter Harvey be "conveyors of blessings and protections" as illustrated during the house blessing ceremony. Not only that, at Venerable Dhammananda's monastery, women plays a leading role in making offerings as seen at the *kathina* or robes offering ceremony as well as leading the short procession to the shrine hall where the ceremony takes place.

At the social and moral level, ordinations of women have far reaching implications. Firstly, it challenges the idea existent among certain section of society that to be born female is to be inferior. According to Ouyporn Khuankaew, a feminist Buddhist activist:

"In Buddhist societies where women are not allowed to be fully ordained as monks, women are often told by monks that having been born a woman is a result of bad karma... the only thing that women can do is to accumulate a lot of merit in this life, so that in their next life they will be born a man, and they can become a monk if they so choose to. This way of thinking makes women feel inferior and they are to blame for the outcome of their lives."

Secondly, as being ordained is meritorious, a person who does so moves to a higher moral realm. For sons ordination is a way for them to express their gratitude to their parents as it enables their parent's rebirth in heaven. In contrast, daughters in the northeast who traditionally do not have the option of ordaining, show their gratitude by becoming prostitutes so that they can support their family and sponsor their brother's ordination.<sup>cxx</sup>

The significance of the gender dimension on the lives and status of women has been debated as gender is only one of the socially constructed axes among others such as age, wealth, and status and merit store. As Peter Jackson and Nerida Cook noted in Thailand, hierarchy is normatively organized along various overlapping vertical axes with royalty taking precedence over commoners, religious specialists over laity, seniors over juniors, males over females and urbanites over villagers even as scholars acknowledge the call for a more egalitarian social order amidst the widening social dislocation and disparities. Nicola Tannenbaum argues that status matters more than gender by citing work on *mae chi* who are "poorer women with little power and less wealth and therefore little claim to spiritual potency". Her analysis of the primacy of status over gender conversely, sidelined the extent to which gender structures and

limits access to status, spiritual potency and power even as she acknowledged the differential access to them based on gender. Poor men, unlike their female counterpart of similar social background have the opportunity of access to monkhood for their religious education and ritual training as well as access to spiritual potency and social mobility as discussed earlier.

Furthermore, there are two different interpretations as to whether the female sex is inferior to the male in Buddhist Thailand. The first as discussed earlier is derived from the 1802 version of the *Trai Phum* cosmological text that sees rebirth of women as inferior, due to bad *karma* or an inadequate store of merit. Female rebirth as inferior is not only written in texts but conveyed by monks and women themselves. According to Tattajivo Bhikkhu of Wat Thammakai, a monk who committed adultery will be reborn 500 times as women. While there is a diversity of views, a female member of Santi Asoke interviewed stated her belief that the female sex is inferior to the male. She attributed her view to the five kinds of suffering that women have but men do not and to the Buddhist scripture as follows:

"according to Buddhist scripture, I was born a woman because in my past life as a man, I broke the third precept with adultery; if I had been a woman, I would have been reborn as a dog."cxxv

In this regard, both ordination as well as fundamental beliefs about the superiority or inferiority of the sexes emphasized the status of men over women. Venerable Dhammananda's efforts for female ordination address one aspect pertaining to the inequitable gender relations. Her explication of the concept of *karma* and reinterpretation of the Buddhist scripture in relation to gender question the inferiority of the female sex. According to her, the statement that one is born

a woman because of bad *karma* is contrary to Buddhist teaching as "everyone is born according to his or her *karma*". She also gave a different interpretation of the five woes that only women suffer and pointed out that two of the woes are reflective of the Indian cultural context not Thai. In particular, one of the woes suffered is leaving her family at marriage, which is not characteristic of the Thai context as usually the husband goes to live with the wife's family. In other words, ordination as well as the belief about gender matters to challenge the belief in the inferiority of the female sex.

Notwithstanding this, male dominance in Thailand is counter-balanced by the traditional system of bilateral kinship and matrilocal residence. Furthermore, status, wealth and educational background affects gender relations between women and men as a successful businesswoman will have men under her employ. Similarly, there are educated women from well-to-do family who excelled as meditation teachers and have laypersons as well as monks as students. John Van Esterik noted that as female meditation teachers, who cannot be monks, they are not threatening politically. In contrast, efforts for female ordination by Venerable Dhammananda have far-reaching implications in the constitution of the male-dominated Sangha.

Stacy Waters in her Masters dissertation of the "Bhikkhuni Sangha in Thailand" critiqued Bernard Faure's characterization of women's efforts to gain entry into the Sangha as based on a masculine soteriological model privileging the mind and denying feminine spirituality based on the body. According to Faure, in this 'unisex' ideological model, women are viewed as inferior to men. On one hand, Waters acknowledged that female ordination entailed

submission into the patriarchal parameters of monastic life. On the other hand, she rejected Faure's assertion that they are masculinizing their practice in 'forgetting' their sexual difference. In fact, by becoming ordained, they are affirming their gender differences or 'feminine spirituality' in ministering to the needs of women and children by drawing on their gendered experiences as women, which include having being daughters, sisters, wives, mothers and grandmothers. CXXXIII

At Venerable Dhammananda's monastery, the emphasis on feminine spirituality is also apparent as there are sermons given based on the lives of the enlightened female monks. These stories firstly, underlined the existence of female monks in history. Secondly, they affirm the female gender identity as it is possible for women to attain enlightenment. These female monks are also noteworthy for they are praised by the Buddha for being foremost in various abilities. Some examples are Maha Pajapati Gotami who has the distinction for being foremost as the longest standing bhikkhuni, Khema for her great insight, Upalavanna for her magical power and Sona renowned for her diligence. In the example of bhikkhuni Sona she achieved enlightenment in her old age while boiling water and Venerable Dhammananda shared that she chose the story on that day as the audiences mainly consisted of the elderly and to stress the value of mundane tasks as a vehicle to enlightenment. Feminine spirituality is reflected in the chant of Gotami Sutta, my first experience of doing a chant that pays homage to a female figure in Thailand. In the sutta, Maha Pajapati Gotami embodies the resolute female who walked miles and miles and perseveres until the Buddha accedes to her request to establish the female monastic order. Remarkably, there are parallels in Venerable Dhammananda's determination to live the bhikkhuni life in spite of the adversity she encountered in Thailand as discussed in earlier sections.

The gendering process effected by the presence of *bhikkhunis* are also discernible in terms of the interactions between lay persons and the female monastic order. Venerable Dhammananda received offerings from lay men via the use of a cloth whereas if there are from laywomen, the use of the cloth is not needed. During the house blessing ceremony those present were the female owner of the house and only her female friends. When asked why she invited *bhikkhunis* for the ceremony she mentioned that *bhikkhunis* can also gain enlightenment. The presence of only female audiences showed a gendering process. I also observed once during fieldwork, a male villager feeling uncertain if it is appropriate for him to be at Venerable Dhammananda's monastery during the robes offering ceremony to which he was reassured that he is welcomed. It seems that the situation arises because the monastery is to cater and minister to women's needs as mentioned earlier. The retreat programme organized so far catered to women specifically. In addition, it is only possible for women to stay overnight there until recently in view of women's safety. However, there are plans to accommodate men who want to stay over-night there and practice, if they are there with their wives.

While agreeing with Waters' observation of 'feminine spirituality' instead of a masculinization of the practice of those ordained as *bhikkhuni* and that there is a gendering process taking place, I also argue that this co-exists with a unisex or more appropriately a model of spirituality that is non-gendered. The training of mindfulness taught to both women and men whether it is *samadhi* (concentration) or *vipassana* (insight) are based on the interconnection of the mind and body rather than a Cartesian dualism of privileging the mind over the body. The *Satipattahana Sutra* or *Foundations of Mindfulness Sutra* outlines these four foundations as being based on the body, feelings, mind and mind objects cxxxiiii rather than focusing on the mind alone.

In the *anapanasati* mindfulness with breathing as well as other mindfulness training, instructions include appropriate body posture to facilitate the practice. The breathing mediates between the mind and the body. As one progresses in the mindfulness training the breathing becomes more subtle and tranquil and the body is transformed as bodily discomfort or pain disappears with the mind becoming calm and concentrated. As noted by Carolyn Anne Klein the Buddhist understanding of subjectivity is not disembodied; "the body is both the subject and object of meditation" and becomes transformed in the process as well, cxxxvi a statement reflective of the teachings at Songdhamma Kalyani.

The meditation practice on the Medicine Buddha at Songdhamma Kalyani embodies the mind/body connection. This practice works with the mind, the heart and the body in its visualization and contemplation exercises. CXXXVIII As part of the process, one not only visualizes and contemplates on the qualities of purity, clarity, depth and vastness of the sky but also opens one's heart to them. The visualization include that of the Medicine Buddha filling the sky with his luminous light body and of the meditators receiving these blessings light through every pore of their body. Not only does one's body bask in the healing energies, the mind is healed from negative states as well. At the end of the process, one's body is transformed and becomes bright and radiant with this blessing light. Furthermore, the healing energies is to be shared with others or the universe in general.

However, mindfulness training as Venerable Dhammananda pointed out is done not only when we are seated but as we go about our daily lives being fully aware of our actions, feelings, thought and speech. At the monastery, this also means mindfulness as we go for almsround, listen to dharma talk, eat, do handicraft or chores such as weeding or cleaning and decorate the monastery for the *kathina* ceremony. Reiterating the focus on being engaged Buddhists at the monastery, Venerable Dhammananda stressed on balancing spiritual self-development with social engagement.

Men and women strive for the cessation of suffering in their gendered body and as ordained persons attend to their followers in a gendered way. However, the model of mindfulness training followed is non-dualistic and non-gendered. It stressed on the interdependence between the body and mind, working as an interconnected whole towards enlightenment.

For the relevance of *Trai Phum* and *Vessantara Jataka* to Thai society see Kornvipa Boonsue, *Buddhism and Gender Bias: An Analysis of JATAKA Tale* (Toronto: York University, 1989).

ii Ibid., 32-3.

While both scholars have differing interpretations of the Buddhist text "Blessings of Ordination", they share in the image of woman as nurturer to her family and religion. For this similarity see A. Thomas Kirsch, "Text and Context: Buddhist Sex Roles/Culture of Gender Revisited," *American Ethnologist* 12, no. 2 (May 1985), 310; and Charles F. Keyes, "Mother or Mistress but Never a Monk: Buddhist Notions of Female Gender in Rural Thailand," *American Ethnologist* 11, no. 2 (May 1984), 229.

The "Blessings of Ordination" text bears striking resemblance to Subinthakuman a popular folktale during the early Bangkok time as appeared in Suwadee T.Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society: A Historical Perspective," in Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice. Ed Suwanna Satha-Anand (Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004), 53-4.

Keyes, "Mother or Mistress but Never a Monk," 227.

vi Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 53.

vii Kirsch, "Text and Context," 311.

viii Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 31.

ix Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>x</sup> Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 32.

xi See for example Khin Thitsa, Providence and Prostitution (London: Change, 1980), 6.

xii Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 32 and Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 52.

For a detailed characteristic of this relationship see Phya Lithai, *Three Worlds According To King Ruang: A Thai Buddhist Cosmology*, trans. Frank E. Reynolds and Mani B. Reynolds (Berkeley: the Group in Buddhist Studies and the Center for South and Southeast Asian Studies of University of California and the Institute of Buddhist Studies, 1982), 166-7.

xiv Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 37-38 and Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 52-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>xv</sup> Suwanna Satha-Anand, "Madsi: The Female Boddhisattva Denied?," in *Women, Gender Relations and Development in Thai Society*. ed. Virada Somswasdi and Sally Theobald (Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 1997), 246-7.

xvi Ibid., 248.

Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 31-2.

xviii lbid., 33.

xix Ibid., 35.

Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 52.

- xxi See Chatsumarn Kabilsingh, *Thai Women in Buddhism* (Berkeley: Parallax Press, 1991), 3-7; and Kornvipa Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 37-8.
- xxii Khin Thitsa, Providence and Prostitution, 11.
- xxiii Kabilsingh, Thai Women in Buddhism, 31.
- Khin Thitsa, *Providence and Prostitution*, 16, quoting Craig Reynolds, "A 19<sup>th</sup> century Defense of Polygamy and some Remarks of the Social History of Women in Thailand," (proceedings, Seventh International Association of Historians of Asia Conference, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, 1979).
- YAV Penny Van Esterik, introduction to Kornvipa Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," iv, quoting Chatsumarn Kabilsingh, "Menstruation: Buddhist Perspective," *International Buddhist Women's Activities* 1988, no. 15: 10-1.
- xxvi Khin Thitsa, Providence and Prostitution, 20.
- This prediction is cited in Etienne Lamotte, *History of Indian Buddhism* (Universite Catholique De Louvain, Institut Orientaliste Louvain-La-Neuve, 1988), 194, quoting *Vibhasa* T 1545, ch. 183, p. 918a.
- Evaluation, 17. Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 41-2; and Khin Thitsa, Providence and Prostitution, 17.
- xxix For a full list of the Eight Garudhammas, see Mettanando Bhikkhu, "After the Buddha," n.d. 75-6.
- xxx See footnote 7 in Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 42.
- For a history of the *bhikkhuni* order in Sri Lanka see Hema Goonatilake, "Women Regaining A Lost Legacy: The Restoration of The *Bhikkhuni* Order in Sri Lanka," in *Out of the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women*. ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo (Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006), 42-7.
- the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women. ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo (Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006), 297 quoting Phra Dhammapitaka (P. Payutto), Panha bhiksuni: bot thodsob sangkhom thai (The Bhikkhuni Problem: A Challenge for Thai Society) (Bangkok: Sukkhaphabjai, 2001), 10-1. While Phra Dhammapitaka has at times seem more open to the ordination of women, he clearly favors the improvement of the present nunhood or mae chi's institution as seen in his interview by Sanitsuda Ekachai, "Where women stand by Bhikkhu Prayudh Payutto," Bangkok Post, 22 September, 2001; available from <a href="http://www.dhrmaweb.org/index.php/Where\_women\_stand\_by\_Bhikkhu\_Prayudh\_Payutto">http://www.dhrmaweb.org/index.php/Where\_women\_stand\_by\_Bhikkhu\_Prayudh\_Payutto;</a>; internet; accessed 15 March 2007.
- Monica Lindberg Falk, "Thai Nuns in Socially Engaged Buddhism", (paper presented at The First International Malaysia-Thailand Conference on South-east Asian Studies, Bangkok, 8-10 October, 2003), 13.
- xxxiv Kabilsingh, Thai Women in Buddhism, 23-5.
- xxxv Boonsue, "Buddhism and Gender Bias," 54.
- xxxvi Ibid., 34-5.
- For a study on the centrality of motherhood to Thai female identity and blaming them for infertility see Pimpawun Boonmongkon, "Infertility as Gender Discourse in Thai Society," in *Women's Studies in Thailand:* Power, Knowledge and Justice. ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand (Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004), 234-40.
- Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 76-7.

- For a historical overview see Malee Pruekpongsawalee, "The Constitutions and The Legal Status of Women in Family Related Laws in Thailand: A Historical Perspective," in *Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice*. ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand (Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004), 85-155.
- For details see ibid, 143-4; and Sanitsuda Ekachai, "Adultery Is For Women Only," in *A Collation of Articles: Sex, Dating and Marriage in Thailand.* ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas (Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law, and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 2002), 132-4.
- xli For details see Malee Pruekpongsawalee, "The Constitutions and The Legal Status of Women," 142.
- Contemporary Discourses on Sexuality in Thai Society," in *Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice.* ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand (Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004), 170-5, 180-7; Chanpen Saengtienchai, John Knodel, Mark Vanlandingham and Anthony Pramualratana, ""Prostitutes Are Better Than Lovers": Wives' Views On The Extramarital Sexual Behavior of Thai Men," in *Genders and Sexualities in Modern Thailand.* ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999), 78-92; Sumalee Bumroongsook, "Courtship Methods," in *A Collation of Articles: Sex, Dating and Marriage in Thailand.* ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas (Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law, and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 2002), 49-58; and Sanitsuda Ekachai, "Must We Have This Vurginity Nonsense," in *A Collation of Articles: Sex, Dating and Marriage in Thailand.* ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas (Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law, and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 2002), 59-61.
- viiii Pruekpongsawalee, "The Constitutions and The Legal Status of Women," 146-9.
- xliv Penny Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," in Women of Southeast Asia. ed. Penny Van Esterik (Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 982), 64-8, 74-6. For an argument that goes even further to posit that prostitutes are viewed more favorably than mae chi and bhikkhuni see Lucinda Peach, "Sex or Sangha? Non-Normative Gender Roles," in Mixed Blessings: Laws, Religions, and Women's Rights in the Asia-Pacific Region. ed. Amanda Whiting and Carolyn Evans (Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,2006), 59. However, Peach's observation failed to distinguish between two labels for prostitutes, namely what Marjorie Muecke termed as "justified" prostitutes and those "stigmatized as sluts and 'streetside toilets"; see Marjorie Muecke, "Mother Sold Food, Daughter Sells Her Body: The Cultural Continuity of Prostitution," Social Science and Medicine 35, no. 7 (1992): 898.
- Peach's conclusion seems more valid in the former category of prostitutes than the latter. Furthermore, questions arise as to who or which section of Thai society views prostitutes more favorably than nuns (her usage refers to both mae chi and bhikkhuni). Peach's argument that Buddhist literature portrayed prostitutes more favorably is contentious and not supported by accounts in the Buddhist literature, namely the *Therigatha* which depicts the story of Addhakasi reborn as a prostitute for disparaging a female renunciant. As Peach noted herself, there are cases of courtesans who renounced their profession, became nuns and gained enlightenment rather than the reverse. This indicates that the latter is the aspiration.
- xlv Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," 74.
- Monica Lindberg Falk, "Women in Between: Becoming Religious Persons in Thailand," in Women's Buddhism Buddhism's Women. ed. Ellison Banks Findly (Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000), 53-4.
- <sup>xlvii</sup> Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," 61.
- See Barend Jan Terwiel, *Monks and Magic*, 3d ed., rev. (Bangkok: White Lotus Press, 1994), 56; and Jane Bunnag, *Buddhist Monk, Buddhist Layman* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1973), 36.
- <sup>xlix</sup> Bunnag, *Buddhist Monk, Buddhist Layman*, 36; and Thomas Kirsch, "Buddhism, Sex-Roles and the Thai Economy," in *Women of Southeast Asia*. ed. Penny Van Esterik (Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982), 17.

- Kirsch, "Text and Context," 303-4.
- i Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," 73.
- ii Yoneo Ishii, Sangha, State and Society (Honolulu: The University of Hawaii Press, 1986), 61.
- The five precepts are guidelines to lead an ethical life. They include abstaining from harming living beings, stealing, sexual misconduct, telling lies and from consuming intoxicants such as alcohol and drugs. In the eight precepts, the third precept as found in the five precepts becomes sexual celibacy and the other additional three precepts are abstaining from taking solid food after noon, entertainment such as singing, dancing and wearing personal adornment and finally from seating on high or luxurious beds.
- <sup>liv</sup> Bunnag, *Buddhist Monk, Buddhist Layman*, 42-7; and for a general discussion of monkhood as an avenue of social mobility see Stanley J. Tambiah, *World Conqueror, World Renouncer* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976), 288-312.
- For an example of the roles of *mae chi* as well as their lowly status in comparison to monks see Sid Brown, *The Journey of One Buddhist Nun* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2001), 22; and for an illustration of the migration of route for monks from the poorer regions to Bangkok vis a vis *mae chi* see David L. Gosling "The Changing Roles of Thailand's Lay Nuns (Mae Chi)," *Southeast Asian Journal of Social Science* 26, no. 1 (1998): 129.
- hi Falk, "Thai Nuns in Socially Engaged Buddhism," 15.
- hii Kabilsingh, Thai Women in Buddhism, 42.
- hiii Ibid., 23-4, 29-30.
- lix For other examples of social practices associated with the idea of menstruation as polluting see Terwiel, *Monks and Magic, 78-9*; and Chatsumarn Kabilsingh, *Women in Buddhism: Questions and Answers* (Bangkok: Thammasat University Press, 1998), 34.
- <sup>lx</sup> Kabilsingh, Thai Women in Buddhism, 19.
- hi Penny Van Esterik, Materializing Thailand (Oxford: Berg, 2000), 66.
- <sup>kii</sup> Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," 77-8.
- kiii Kirsch, "Text and Context," 316.
- hiv lbid.; and see also footnote 2 in Keyes, "Mother or Mistress but Never a Monk," 238.
- hav Kirsch, "Text and Context," 317.
- See footnote 2 in Keyes, "Mother or Mistress but Never a Monk," 238.
- kirsch, "Text and Context," 317. For an example of such research see Marjorie Muecke, "Female Sexuality in Thai Discourses about Mae chi," *Culture, Health & Sexuality* 6, no.3 (May-June 2004): 221-38.
- For a discussion of the importance of an accurate and usable past see Rita Gross, *Buddhism After Patriarchy* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), 17-24. However, Gross have been criticized for implicitly asserting cultural hegemony in suggesting the superiority of western feminist Buddhists over their eastern counterpart as noted by Pui-Lan Kwok introduction to *Postcolonialism, Feminism & Religious Discourse* (New

- York: Routledge, 2002), 23-28; and Wei-Yi Cheng, "Rethinking Western Feminist Critiques on Buddhism"; available from <a href="http://www.Chibs.edu.tw/exchange/CONFERENCE/4cicob/fulltext/wei-yee.htm">http://www.Chibs.edu.tw/exchange/CONFERENCE/4cicob/fulltext/wei-yee.htm</a>; internet; accessed 8 September 2005.
- hix Nicola Tannenbaum, "Buddhism, Prostitution, and Sex: Limits on the Academic Discourse on Gender in Thailand," in *Genders and Sexualities in Modern Thailand*. ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999), 245.
- lix Ibid., 247. See also Philip C. Almond, *The British Discovery of Buddhism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 24-28, 139-141.
- <sup>lexi</sup> Gregory Schopen, "Archaeology and Protestant Presuppositions in the Study of Indian Buddhism," *History of Religions* 31, no.1 (August 1991): 1-23.
- Ixxii Tambiah, World Conqueror, World Renouncer, 185-7.
- hxiii Charles Hallisey, "Roads Taken And Not Taken In The Study of Theravada Buddhism," in *Curators Of The Buddha*. ed. Donald S. Lopez, Jr. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995), 49.
- hxiv Tannenbaum, "Buddhism, Prostitution, and Sex," 243.
- <sup>lxxv</sup> Van Esterik, Materializing Thailand, 66.
- lxxvi Ibid., 65.
- hxxvii Buddhism is hardly a symbol of unity for Thai-Muslims. For a discussion of the failure of the Phra Dhammaduta to strengthen Thai Muslims attachment to Buddhism and similar efforts at national integration among the hill people see Somboon Suksamran, *Political Buddhism in Southeast Asia* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1976), 115-6.
- Suwanna Satha-Anand, "Truth Over Convention: Feminist Interpretations of Buddhism," in *Religious Fundamentalisms and the Human Rights of Women*. ed. Courtney W. Howland (New York: St. Martin's Press 1999), 285 quoting *Majjhima-Nikaya* 1:169.
- For details of the first wave of pioneering bhikkhuni see Chatsumarn Kabilsingh, *Thai Women in Buddhism*, 45-8.
- <sup>laxx</sup> Tomomi Ito, "Bhikkhuni Revival Movements," Yasodhara 17, no. 1 (October-December 2000): 4.
- bxxi Kabilsingh, Thai Women in Buddhism, 46.
- bxxxii For details of two independent nunneries in Chiang Mai that appropriate the Jamathevi legend for legitimation see Muecke, "Female Sexuality in Thai Discourses about Mae chi," 232-4; and for a discussion of the various use of the past see Tambiah, *World Conqueror, World Renouncer*, 528-30.
- Rey Chow, Writing Diaspora: Tactics of Intervention in Contemporary Cultural Studies (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993), 26. Furthermore, the preoccupation on being authentic operates to prevent discussing issue of hegemony as noted by Trinh T. Minh-ha, Woman, Native, Other (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989), 88.
- Alycia Nicholas, "The Bhikkhuni Movement in Thailand: Information Compiled," in A Collation of Articles on Thai Women and Buddhism. ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas (Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law

and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiang Mai University, 2002), 33. For a discussion of the situation faced by feminists in the "Third World" see Kumari Jayawardena, Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World, rev. ed. (London: Zed Books, 1994), 2-3. Specifically, for the situation in Malaysia see Lai Suat Yan, "The Women's Movement in Peninsular Malaysia," in Social Movements in Malaysia. ed. Meredith L. Weiss and Saliha Hassan (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003), 48.

- hxxv Alycia Nicholas, "The Bhikkhuni Movement in Thailand," 33.
- Sulak Sivaraksa, Socially Engaged Buddhism (Delhi: B. R. Publishing Corporation, 2005), 138.
- Tambiah, World Conqueror, World Renouncer, 230-61 and Peter A. Jackson Buddhism, Legitimation, and Conflict (Pasir Panjang: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1989), 63-85.
- kxxviii An example of this is the difference in the interpretation of the monastic rules as noted by Kamala Tiyavanich, Forest Recollections: Wandering Monks in Twentieth-century Thailand, Southeast Asia ed. (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1997), 269-73.
- hxxix Bhikkhuni Kusuma, "How I Became a Bhikkhuni," Sakyaditha 16 no 2 (Summer 2008): 16.
- <sup>xc</sup> For details of the Dambulla *Bhikkhuni* Training Centre see, Wei-Yi Cheng, *Buddhist Nuns in Taiwan and Sri Lanka* (London: Routledge, Taylor Francis Group, 2007), 29-34.
- xci Venerable Dhammananda, "Report from Hamburg Congress July 2007," *Yasodhara* 23/4, no 92 (July-September 2007): 13-6.
- xcii Karma Lekshe Tsomo, "Introduction," in Bridging Worlds: Buddhist Women's Voices Across Generations. ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo (Taipeh: Yuan Chuan Press, 2004), 4-8.
- xciii This is illustrated in graphic form in Chatsumarn Kabilsingh, A Comparative Study of Bhikkhuni Patimokkha (Delhi: Chaukhambha Orientalia, 1984), 174-5, 181.
- xciv Richard Gombrich, Theravada Buddhism (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1988), 209.
- xev Ibid., 16.
- Amarasiri Weeraratne, "Vicissitudes of the Sri Lankan *bhikkunis* to establish the *bhikkhuni* lineage in China see Amarasiri Weeraratne, "Vicissitudes of the *Bhikkhuni* Order," *Yasodhara* 22/1, no. 85 (October-December 2005): 15-17; and Hema Goonatilake, "The Forgotten Women of Anuradhapura: "Her Story" Replaced by 'History'," in *Gendering The Spirit: Women, Religion & the Post-Colonial Response*, ed. Durre S. Ahmed (London: Zed Books, 2002), 99-100.
- Weeraratne, "Revival of the *Bhikkhuni Sasana* in Sri Lanka," *Yasodhara* 20/2, no. 78 (January-Macrh 2004): 12. Also for a list of the methods of higher ordination for *bhikkhu* and *bhikkhuni* see *Bhikkhuni* Bhadra, Higher Ordination That Leads to the Eradication of Defilements," *WFB Review* XXXIX, no. 3 and 4 (July-December 2002): 89-93.
- Lorraine Clarke, review of *The Revival of The Theravada Bhikkhuni Order*, by Pandit Talalle Dhammaloka, trans. Amarasiri Weeraratne (Sakyaditha, Sri Lanka's branch, 1998), *Yasodhara* 16, no. 1 (October-December 1999): 21.
- See Varaporn Chamsanit, "Settling The Debate On Bhikkhuni Ordination in Thailand," 300 quoting Phra Phaisan Wisalo, *Phutthasasna thai nai ana-khod, Naew-nom lae thang-ok jak wikrit* (Thai Buddhism in the Future, Trends and Crisis Solutions) (Bangkok: SodSri-Saridwong Fundation, 2003), 363.

- <sup>c</sup> For details of reformist Buddhism in Thailand and Bhikkhu Buddhadasa's role see Jackson *Buddhism*, *Legitimation*, and Conflict, 47-61, 115-35.
- of For an exposition of this doctrine see Donald K. Swearer, Me and Mine: Selected Essays of Bhikkhu Buddhadasa (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), 141-5.
- cii For Buddhadasa's contribution to inter-religious understanding see ibid, 146-155; Donald K. Swearer. "The Ecumenical Vision of Buddhadasa Bhikkhu and His Dialogue with Christianity," *Seeds Of Peace* 21, no. 1 (January-April 2005): 32-5; Vasana Chinvarakorn, In Spirit: Unity in Diversity," trans. *Bangkok Post* 27 August 2006; and Santikaro, "In Spirit: Toward Genuine Inter-faith Understanding," *Bangkok Post* 24 September 2006.
- ciii See for example Tomomi Ito, "Sulak and Engaged Buddhists in Contemporary Thai Society," in *Socially Engaged Spirituality*. ed. David W. Chappell (Bangkok: Sathirakoses-Nagapradipa Foundation, 2003), 241-50 and "Thai Inter-religious Commisson for Development," available from <a href="http://www.sulak-sivaraksa.org/web/network21.php?print=1">http://www.sulak-sivaraksa.org/web/network21.php?print=1</a>; internet; accessed 11 December 2007.
- civ Charles F. Keyes, "Moral Authority of the Sangha and Modernity in Thailand," in *Socially Engaged Buddhism* For The New Millennium. ed. Sulak Sivaraksa, Pipob Udomittipong and Chris Walker (Bangkok: Sathirakoses-Nagapradipa Foundation and Foundation For Children, 1999), 121-47.
- "Juliana Essen, "Right Development": The Santi Asoke Buddhist Reform Movement in Thailand (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2005), 126-7.
- cvi Ibid., 127.
- <sup>cvii</sup> Santikaro Bhikkhu, "Buddhadasa Bhikkhu: Life and Society through the Natural Eyes of Voidness," in *Engaged Buddhism: Buddhist Liberation Movements in Asia*. ed. Christopher S. Queen and Sallie B. King (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), 185.
- cviii For a supportive view see Sulak Sivaraksa, *Socially Engaged Buddhism*, 148-9 while Tomomi Ito noted an opposing view in her presentation at the 9<sup>th</sup> Sakyaditha International Conference on Buddhist Woman, Kuala Lumpur, 18-20 June 2006.
- cix Santikaro, "Buddhadasa Bhikkhu: the Natural Eyes of Voidness," 185.
- <sup>cx</sup> Nevertheless, the notion of motherhood can also be an instrument of repression, see for example Bernard Faure, *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity and Gender* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003), 326-7.
- <sup>cxi</sup> Penny Van Esterik, "Introduction," in W*omen of Southeast Asia*. ed. Penny Van Esterik (Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982), 5.
- See Van Esterik, *Materializng Thailand*, 212-22; Suchada Thaweesit, "The fluidity of Thai Women's Gendered and Sexual Subjectivities," *Culture, Health & Sexuality* 6, no.3 (May-June 2006): 205-219; Rosi Braidotti, *Nomadic Subjects: Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Contemporary Feminist Theory* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994); and Judith Butler, *Bodies that Matter, on the Discursive Limits of Sex* (New York: Routledge, 1983).
- Gender ambiguity is exacerbated in the case of *kathoey*, a transgender category that refers to hermaphrodites and transsexual males by locals in Thailand as observed by Peter A. Jackson, "Tolerant But Unaccepting: The Myth of a Thai "Gay Paradise" in *Genders & Sexualities In Modern Thailand*. ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999), 227, 229. *Kathoey* is even regarded as a third gender by Rosalind Morris, "Three Sexes and Four Sexualities: Redressing the Discourses on Gender and Sexuality in Contemporary Thailand," *Positions* 2, no. 1 (1994): 15-43. In the North American context, female and male *berdache* roles are considered as the third and fourth genders respectively as argued by Will Roscoe, "How to Become a Berdache: Toward a Unified

Analysis of Gender Diversity," in *Third Sex, Third Gender: Beyond Sexual Dimorphism in Culture and History*. ed. Gilbert Herdt (New York: Zone Books, 1994), 329-72.

- criv For an argument of the relevance of the use of category in light of poststructuralist theorizing, in the case of being a lesbian even as the self is conceptualized as contingent see Carol Guess, "Deconstructing Me: On being (Out) in the Academy," in *Third Wave Agenda: Being Feminist, Doing Feminism*. ed. Leslie Heywood and Jennifer Drake (Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1997), 155-67. For a debate on the necessity of the category women in light of postmodernist thought on the "death of the subject" as well as reconciling it with the notion of a shifting identity see Seyla Benhabib et al., *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange* (New York: Routledge, 1995). For the usefulness and limits of postmodernist theorizing to feminism see Linda J. Nicholson, ed., *Feminism/Postmodenism* (New York: Routledge, 1990). For the use of strategic essentialism such as class as proposed by Gayatri Spivak see Rosemary George, "Feminists theorize colonial/postcolonial," 218-20.
- cxv Van Esterik, "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism," 62, 73.
- cxvi Lai Suat Yan, "Linking Global With Local: The Future of the Bhikkhuni Ordination in the the Theravada Tradition," *Eastern Horizon*, no. 26 (September 2008): 58.
- exvii Terwiel, "Monks and Magic, 243.
- exviii Peter Harvey, An Introduction to Buddhism (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 241.
- cxix Ouyporn Khuankaew, "Buddhism and Domestic Violence," in A Collation of Articles on Thai Women and Buddhism. ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas (Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiang Mai University and the Foundation for Women, Law and Rural Development, 2002), 65.
- <sup>cxx</sup> Marjorie Muecke, "Mother Sold Food, Daughter Sells Her Body: The Cultural Continuity of Buddhism," *Social Science Medicine* 35 (1992), 897.
- cxxi Nerida M. Cook and Peter A. Jackson, "Introduction/Desiring Constructs: Transforming Sex/Gender Orders in Twentieth-Century Thailand," in *Genders & Sexualities In Modern Thailand*. ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook (Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999), 9.
- cxxiiTannenbaum, "Buddhism, Prostitution, and Sex," 254.
- Amara Pongsapich, "Feminism Theories and Praxis: Women's Social Movement in Thailand," in *Women, Gemder Relations and Development in Thai Society*. ed. Virada Somswasdi and Sally Theobald (Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiang Mai University, 1997), 14 quoting Nithinan Yosaengrat, "Katho Kaew Thammakai," *Ban Mai Ru Rooy* 3/5 (1987).
- Essen, "Right Development", 126.
- cxxv Ibid.
- cxxvi Kabilsingh, Thai Women In Buddhism, 31.
- cxxvii Ibid., 126.
- Amara Pongsapich, "Feminism Theories and Praxis," 9-12, 15. For social practices that countered male dominance during the early Bangkok period see Suwadee Patana, "Gender Relations in Thai Society," 62-6.
- <sup>cxxix</sup> John Van Esterik, "Women Meditation Teachers in Thailand," in *Women of Southeast Asia*. ed. Penny Van Esterik (Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 982), 52.

- cxxx Stacy Waters,"Bhikkhuni Sangha in Thailand: The Struggle to Create Space for Female Spirituality through Moastic Ordination," (MA research paper, University of Stanford, 2003), 26-7.
- cxxxi Faure, The Power Of Denial, 13.
- cxxxii Ibid., 27.
- «Satipatthana Sutra," in *Teachings of the Buddha: The Long Discourses of the Buddha*, trans. Maurice Walshe (Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1987).
- The Vipassana meditation taught at the Northern Insight Meditation Center, Chiang Mai that is based on the four foundation of mindfulness is available from <a href="http://www.palikanon.com/vipassana/tapotaram.htm">http://www.palikanon.com/vipassana/tapotaram.htm</a>; internet; accessed 11 December 2007. See in particular pages 1-2, 5-7. Mindfulness of the body refers to the mind following and acknowledging our bodily movement while of feelings relates to feelings of joy, pain or sadness, of mind pertains to our thoughts or thinking and mindfulness of mind objects refers to the mind following and acknowledging the five hindrances of like, dislike, drowsiness, anxiety and doubt.
- cxxxv See for example the anapanasati practice at Suan Mokh, Chaiya, Thailand available from <a href="http://www.suanmokh.org/archive/aps/mwb-abc1.htm">http://www.suanmokh.org/archive/aps/mwb-abc1.htm</a>; internet; accessed 7 January 2008.
- Anne Carolyn Klein, "Buddhists Understanding of Subjectivity," in *Buddhist Women and Social Justice: Ideals, Challenges and Achievements*. ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2004) 26-7.
- <sup>cxxxvii</sup> Tulku Thondup Rinpoche, "Meditation on the Medicine Buddha," *Yasodhara* 23/4, no. 92 (July-September 2007): 4-5.

## **Bibliography**

- Almond, Philip C. *The British Discovery of Buddhism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Benhabib, Seyla, Judith Butler, Drucilla Cornell, and Nancy Fraser. Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Bhadra, *Bhikkhuni*. "Higher Ordination That Leads to the Eradication of Defilements." WFB Review XXXIX, no. 3 and 4 (July-December 2002): 89-93.
- Boonmongkon, Pimpawun. "Infertility as Gender Discourse in Thai Society." In Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice, ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand, 231-57. Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004.
- Boonsue, Kornvipa. Buddhism and Gender Bias: An Analysis of JATAKA Tale. Toronto: York University, 1989.
- Braidotti, Rosi. Nomadic Subjects: Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Contemporary Feminist Theory. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.
- Brown, Sid. *The Journey of One Buddhist Nun*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2001.
- Bumroongsook, Sumalee. "Courtship Methods." In *A Collation of Articles: Sex, Dating and Marriage in Thailand*, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas, 33-58. Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law, and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 2002.
- Bunnag, Jane. Buddhist Monk, Buddhist Layman. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1973.
- Butler, Judith. Bodies that Matter, on the Discursive Limits of Sex. New York: Routledge, 1983.
- Cheng, Wei-Yi "Rethinking Western Feminist Critiques on Buddhism"; available from <a href="http://www.Chibs.edu.tw/exchange/CONFERENCE/4cicob/fulltext/wei-yee.htm">http://www.Chibs.edu.tw/exchange/CONFERENCE/4cicob/fulltext/wei-yee.htm</a>; internet; accessed 8 September 2005.
- . Buddhist Nuns in Taiwan and Sri Lanka. London: Routledge, Taylor Francis Group, 2007.
- Chinvarakorn, Vasana. "In Spirit: Unity in Diversity." trans. *Bangkok Post* 27 August 2006.

- Chow, Rey. Writing Diaspora: Tactics of Intervention in Contemporary Cultural Studies. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.
- Clarke, Lorraine. Review of *The Revival of The Theravada Bhikkhuni Order*, by Pandit Talalle Dhammaloka. Trans. Amarasiri Weeraratne. *Yasodhara* 16, no.1 (October-December 1999): 20-23.
- Cook, Nerida M. and Peter A. Jackson, "Introduction/Desiring Constructs: Transforming Sex/Gender Orders in Twentieth-Century Thailand." In *Genders & Sexualities In Modern Thailand*, ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook, 1-27. Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999.
- Dhammananda, Venerable. *Bhikkhuni: The Reflection of Gender in Thai Society*, ed.

  Virada Somsawasdi, Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiang Mai University, 2003), 51. Quoted in Varaporn Chamsanit, "Settling The Debate On Bhikkhuni Ordination in Thailand: Why Is It Difficult?" In *Out of the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women*, ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 296-304. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Report from Hamburg Congress July 2007." *Yasodhara* 23/4, no 92 (July-September 2007): 13-6.
- Dhammapitaka, Phra (P. Payutto), *Panha bhiksuni: bot thodsob sangkhom thai* (The *Bhikkhuni* Problem: A Challenge for Thai Society). Bangkok: Sukkhaphabjai, 2001, 10-11. Quoted in Varaporn Chamsanit, "Settling The Debate On Bhikkhuni Ordination in Thailand: Why Is It Difficult?" In *Out of the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women*, ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 296-304. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006.
- Dhammapitaka, Phra (P. Payutto), "Where Women Stand by Bhikkhu Prayudh Payutto." Interview by Sanitsuda Ekachai. *Bangkok Post*, 22 September, 2001; available from <a href="http://www.dhrmaweb.org/index.php/Where\_women\_stand\_by\_Bhikkhu\_Prayudh\_Payutto">http://www.dhrmaweb.org/index.php/Where\_women\_stand\_by\_Bhikkhu\_Prayudh\_Payutto</a>; internet; accessed 15 March 2007.
- Ekachai, Sanitsuda. "Must We Have This Virginity Nonsense." In *A Collation of Articles: Sex, Dating and Marriage in Thailand*, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas, 59-61. Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law, and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 2002.
- Essen, Juliana. "Right Development": The Santi Asoke Buddhist Reform Movement in Thailand. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2005.
- Falk, Monica Lindberg. "Women in Between: Becoming Religious Persons in Thailand." In Women's Buddhism Buddhism's Women, ed. Ellison Banks Findly, 37-57. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000.

- . "Thai Nuns in Socially Engaged Buddhism." Paper submitted to the first International Malaysia-Thailand Conference on South-east Asia Asian Studies, Mahidol University, Bangkok, 8-10 October 2003.
- Faure, Bernard. The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity and Gender. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- George, Rosemary M. "Feminists theorize colonial/postcolonial." In *The Cambridge Companion to Feminist Literary Theory*, ed. Ellen Rooney, 211-31. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Gombrich, Richard. Theravada Buddhism. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1988.
- Goonatilake, Hema "The Forgotten Women of Anuradhapura: "Her Story" Replaced by 'History'." In *Gendering The Spirit: Women, Religion & the Post-Colonial Response*, ed. Durre S. Ahmed, 91-102. London: Zed Books, 2002.
- . "Women Regaining A Lost Legacy: The Restoration of The *Bhikkhuni* Order in Sri Lanka." In *Out of the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women*, ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 296-304. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006.
- Gosling, David L. "The Changing Roles of Thailand's Lay Nuns (Mae Chi)." Southeast Asian Journal of Social Science 26, no.1 (1998): 121-142.
- Gross, Rita. Buddhism After Patriarchy. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993.
- Guess, Carol. "Deconstructing Me: On being (Out) in the Academy." In *Third Wave Agenda: Being Feminist, Doing Feminism*, ed. Leslie Heywood and Jennifer Drake, 155-67. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1997.
- Hallisey, Charles. "Roads Taken And Not Taken In The Study of Theravada Buddhism." In *Curators Of The Buddha*, ed. Donald S. Lopez, Jr., 31-61. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995.
- Harvey, Peter. An Introduction to Buddhism: Teachings, History and Practices. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Ishii, Yoneo. Sangha, State and Society. Honolulu: The University of Hawaii Press, 1986.
- Ito, Tomomi. "Bhikkhuni Revival Movements." *Yasodhara* 17, no.1 (October-December 2000): 3-5.

. "Sulak and Engaged Buddhists in Contemporary Thai Society." In Socially Engaged Spirituality, ed. David W. Chappell, 241-50. Bangkok: Sathirakoses-Nagapradipa Foundation, 2003. lackson, Peter A. Buddhism, Legitimation, and Conflict. Pasir Panjang: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1989. . "Tolerant But Unaccepting: The Myth of a Thai "Gay Paradise"." In Genders & Sexualities In Modern Thailand, ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook, 226-42. Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999. Jayawardena, Kumari. Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World, rev. ed. London: Zed Books, 1994. Kabilsingh, Chatsumarn. A Comparative Study of Bhikkhuni Patimokkha. Delhi: Chaukhambha Orientalia, 1984. .Women in Buddhism: Questions and Answers. Bangkok: Thammasat University Press, 1998. . "Menstruation: Buddhist Perspective," International Buddhist Women's Activities 1988, no. 15: 10-1. Quoted in Penny Van Esterik, Introduction to Buddhism and Gender Bias: An Analysis of JATAKA Tale, by Kornvipa Boonsue. Toronto: York University, 1989. . Thai Women in Buddhism. Berkeley: Parallax Press, 1991. Keyes, Charles F. "Mother or Mistress but Never a Monk: Buddhist Notions of Female Gender in Rural Thailand." American Ethnologist 11, no. 2 (May 1984): 223-241. . "Moral Authority of the Sangha and Modernity in Thailand." In Socially Engaged Buddhism For The New Millennium, ed. Sulak Sivaraksa, Pipob Udomittipong and Chris Walker, 121-47. Bangkok: Sathirakoses-Nagapradipa Foundation and Foundation For Children, 1999. Khin Thitsa, Providence and Prostitution. London: Change, 1980. Kirsch, Thomas A. "Buddhism, Sex-Roles and the Thai Economy." In Women of Southeast Asia, ed. Penny Van Esterik, 16-41. Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982. . "Text and Context: Buddhist Sex Roles/Culture of Gender Revisited," American Ethnologist 12, no. 2 (May 1985): 302-320.

- Khuankaew, Ouyporn. "Buddhism and Domestic Violence: My Personal Experiences." In A Collation of Articles on Thai Women and Buddhism, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas, 62-70. Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Faculty of Social Sciences, Chiang Mai University, 2002.
  - . "Thai Buddhism: Women's Ordination Or More Prostitution." In *A Collation of Articles on Thai Women and Buddhism*, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas, 50-61. Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Faculty of Social Sciences, Chiang Mai University, 2002.
- Klein, Carolyn A. "Buddhists Understanding of Subjectivity." In *Buddhist Women and Social Justice: Ideals, Challenges and Achievements*, ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 23-34. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2004.
- Kwok, Pui-Lan. Introduction to *Postcolonialism*, *Feminism & Religious Discourse*. New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Kusuma, Bhikkhuni. "How I Became a Bhikkhuni." *Sakyaditha* 16, no. 2 (Summer 2008): 16-17.
- Lai, Suat-Yan. "The Women's Movement in Peninsular Malaysia." In *Social Movements in Malaysia*, ed. Meredith L. Weiss and Saliha Hassan, 45-74. London: RoutledgeCurzon, Taylor and Francis Group, 2003.
- . "Linking Global With Local: The Future of Bhikkhuni Ordination in the Theravada Tradition." *Eastern Horizon* no. 26 (September 2008): 56-61.
- Majjhima-Nikaya I:169. Quoted in Suwanna Satha-Anand, "Truth Over Convention: Feminist Interpretations of Buddhism." In Religious Fundamentalisms and the Human Rights of Women, ed. Courtney W. Howland, 281-292. New York: St. Martin's Press 1999.
- Mettanando, Bhikkhu, "After the Buddha." Trans. from his original publication in Thai, Thailand, 2004.
- Morris, Rosalind. "Three Sexes and Four Sexualities: Redressing the Discourses on Gender and Sexuality in Contemporary Thailand." *Positions* 2, no. 1 (1994): 15-43.
- Muecke, Marjorie. "Mother Sold Food, Daughter Sells Her Body: The Cultural Continuity of Buddhism." *Social Science Medicine* 35, no. 7 (1992): 891-901.
- . "Female Sexuality in Thai Discourses about Maechii (lay nuns)." *Culture, Health and Sexuality* 6, no. 3 (May-June 2004): 221-238.

- Nicholas, Alycia. "The *Bhikkhuni* Movement in Thailand: Information Compiled." In *A Collation of Articles on Thai Women and Buddhism*, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Alycia Nicholas, 24-36. Chiang Mai: Foundation for Women, Law and Rural Development and Women's Studies Center, Faculty of Social Sciences, Chiang Mai University, 2002.
- Nicholson, Linda J. ed. Feminism/Postmodenism. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Northern Insight Meditation Center, Chiang Mai available from <a href="http://www.palikanon.com/vipassana/tapotaram.htm">http://www.palikanon.com/vipassana/tapotaram.htm</a>; internet; accessed 11 December 2007.
- Mettanando, Bhikkhu, "After the Buddha." Trans. from his original publication in Thai, Thailand, 2004.
- Patana, Suwadee T. "Gender Relations in Thai Society: A Historical Perspective." In Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice, ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand, 37-84. Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004.
- Peach, Lucinda. "Sex or Sangha? Non-Normative Gender Roles." In *Mixed Blessings:*Laws, Religions, and Women's Rights in the Asia-Pacific Region, ed. Amanda Whiting and Carolyn Evans, 25-60. Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2006.
  Pesala, Bhikkhu. The Debate of King Milinda: An Abridgement of the Milinda Panha, rev. ed., Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 1998.
- Pruekpongsawalee, Malee. "The Constitutions and The Legal Status of Women in Family Related Laws in Thailand: A Historical Perspective." In *Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice*, ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand, 85-155. Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004.
- Reynolds, Frank E. and Mani B. Reynolds trans. with an intro. and notes *Three Worlds According To King Ruang: A Thai Buddhist Cosmology*. Berkeley: the Group in Buddhist Studies and the Center for South and Southeast Asian Studies of University of California and the Institute of Buddhist Studies, 1982.
- Roscoe, Will. "How to Become a Berdache: Toward a Unified Analysis of Gender Diversity." In *Third Sex, Third Gender: Beyond Sexual Dimorphism in Culture and History*, ed. Gilbert Herdt, 329-72. New York: Zone Books, 1994.
- Saengtienchai, Chanpen, John Knodel, Mark Vanlandingham, and Anthony Pramualratana. ""Prostitutes Are Better Than Lovers": Wives' Views On The Extramarital Sexual Behavior of Thai Men." In *Genders and Sexualities in Modern Thailand*, ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook, 78-92. Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999.

- Santikaro, Bhikkhu. "Buddhadasa Bhikkhu: Life and Society through the Natural Eyes of Voidness." In *Engaged Buddhism: Buddhist Liberation Movements in Asia*, ed. Christopher S. Queen and Sallie B. King, 147-93. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996.
- . "In Spirit: Toward Genuine Inter-faith Understanding." *Bangkok Post* 24 September 2006.
- Satha-Anand, Suwanna. "Madsi: The Female Boddhisattva Denied?" In Women, Gender Relations and Development in Thai Society, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Sally Theobald, 243-56. Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiangmai University, 1997.
- . "Truth Over Convention: Feminist Interpretations of Buddhism." In *Religious Fundamentalisms and the Human Rights of Women*, ed. Courtney W. Howland, 281-91. New York: St. Martin's Press 1999.
- "Satipatthana Sutra" In *Teachings of the Buddha: The Long Discourses of the Buddha*, trans. Maurice Walshe. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1987.
- Schopen, Gregory. "Archaeology and Protestant Presuppositions in the Study of Indian Buddhism." *History of Religions* 31, no.1 (August 1991): 1-23.
- Sivaraksa, Sulak. Socially Engaged Buddhism. Delhi: B. R. Publishing Corporation, 2005.
- Songsamphan, Chalidaporn. "Political and Gender Power Relations: Contemporary Discourses on Sexuality in Thai Society." In *Women's Studies in Thailand: Power, Knowledge and Justice*, ed. Suwanna Satha-Anand, 157-192. Seoul: Ewha Woman's University Press, 2004.
- Suan Mokh, Chaiya, Thailand available from <a href="http://www.suanmokh.org/archive/aps/mwb-abc1.htm">http://www.suanmokh.org/archive/aps/mwb-abc1.htm</a>; internet; accessed 7 January 2008.
- Suksamran, Somboon. *Political Buddhism in Southeast Asia*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1976.
- Swearer, Donald K. Me and Mine: Selected Essays of Bhikkhu Buddhadasa. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989.
- . "The Ecumenical Vision of Buddhadasa Bhikkhu and His Dialogue with Christianity," *Seeds Of Peace* 21, no. 1 (January-April 2005): 32-5.
- Swearer, Donald K. and Sommai Premchit. *The Legend of Queen Cama*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1998.
- Tambiah, Stanley J. World Conqueror, World Renouncer. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.

- Tannenbaum, Nicola. "Buddhism, Prostitution, and Sex: Limits on the Academic Discourse on Gender in Thailand." In *Genders and Sexualities in Modern Thailand*, ed. Peter A. Jackson and Nerida M. Cook, 243-60. Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1999.
- "Thai Inter-religious Commisson for Development," available from <a href="http://www.sulak-sivaraksa.org/web/network21.php?print=1">http://www.sulak-sivaraksa.org/web/network21.php?print=1</a>; internet; accessed 11 December 2007.
- Terwiel, Barend J. Monks and Magic, 3d ed., rev. Bangkok: White Lotus Press, 1994.
- Thaweesit, Suchada. "The fluidity of Thai Women's Gendered and Sexual Subjectivities." Culture, Health & Sexuality 6, no.3 (May-June 2006): 205-219.
- Tiyavanich, Kamala. Forest Recollections: Wandering Monks in Twentieth-century Thailand, Southeast Asia ed. Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books, 1997.
- Trinh, Minh-ha T. Woman, Native, Other. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989.
- Tsomo, Karma L. "Introduction." In *Bridging Worlds: Buddhist Women's Voices Across Generations*. ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 1-12. Taipeh: Yuan Chuan Press, 2004.
- Tulku Thondup Rinpoche, "Meditation on the Medicine Buddha." *Yasodhara* 23/4, no. 92 (July-September 2007): 4-5.
- Van Esterik, John. "Women Meditation Teachers in Thailand." In *Women of Southeast Asia*, ed. Penny Van Esterik, 42-78. Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982.
- Van Esterik, Penny. "Laywomen in Theravada Buddhism." In *Women of Southeast Asia*. ed. Penny Van Esterik, 55-78. Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." In *Women of Southeast Asia*, ed. Penny Van Esterik, 1-15.

  Illinois: Northern Illinois University and Center for Southeast Asian Studies, 1982.
  - . Materializing Thailand. Oxford: Berg, 2000.
- Vibhasa T 1545, ch. 183, p. 918a. Quoted in Etienne Lamotte, History of Indian Buddhism. Universite Catholique De Louvain, Institut Orientaliste Louvain-La-Neuve, 1988.
- Visweswaran, Kamala. Fictions of Feminist Ethnography. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1994.

- Waters, Stacy. "Bhikkhuni Sangha in Thailand: The Struggle to Create Space for Female Spirituality through Monastic Ordination." MA research paper University of Stanford, 2003.
- Weeraratne, Amarasiri. "Vicissitudes of the *Bhikkhuni* Order." *Yasodhara* 22/1, no. 85 (October-December 2005): 15-7.
  - \_\_\_\_."Revival of the *Bhikkhuni Sasana* in Sri Lanka." *Yasodhara* 20/2, no. 78 (January-Macrh 2004): 10-3.
- Wisalo, Pharsan. Phra Phutthasasna thai nai ana-khod, Naew-nom lae thang-ok jak wikrit (Thai Buddhism in the Future, Trends and Crisis Solutions) (Bangkok: SodSri-Saridwong Fundation, 2003), 363. Quoted in Varaporn Chamsanit, "Settling The Debate On Bhikkhuni Ordination in Thailand: Why Is It Difficult?" In Out of the Shadows: Socially Engaged Buddhist Women, ed. Karma Lekshe Tsomo, 296-304. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, A Division of Indian Books Centre, 2006.
- Yosaengrat, Nithinan. "Katho Kaew Thammakai," *Ban Mai Ru Rooy* 3/5 (1987). Quoted in Amara Pongsapich, "Feminism Theories and Praxis: Women's Social Movement in Thailand." In *Women, Gemder Relations and Development in Thai Society*, ed. Virada Somswasdi and Sally Theobald, 3-51. Chiang Mai: Women's Studies Center, Chiang Mai University, 1997.